USDC SDNY

DOCUMENT

ELECTRONICALLY FILED

## OFFICE OF THE MONITOR

NUNEZ, ET AL. V. CITY OF NEW YORK, ET AL.

Steve J. Martin

Anna E. Friedberg Deputy Monitor

135 West 41st Street, 5th Floor New York, NY 10036 +1 646 895 6567 | afriedberg@tillidgroup.com

May 11, 2018

## VIA ECF

The Honorable Laura T. Swain United States District Court Southern District of New York 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10006

Re: Nunez, et al. v. City of New York, et al., 11-cv-5845 (LTS) (JCF)

Dear Judge Swain,

We write to respectfully recommend a modification to the *Nunez* Consent Judgment (dkt. 249) regarding the requirement for Non-DOC Staff Members who witness a Use of Force Incident that results in an apparent injury to report the incident in writing pursuant to § V. (Use of Force Reporting & Tracking), ¶ 10. The Monitoring Team recommends that this provision is modified to require Non-DOC Staff Members who witness a Use of Force Incident to report the incident in writing regardless of whether the Use of Force Incident "results in an apparent injury." The modifier of "results in an apparent injury" adds a subjective element to the reporting requirement that is confusing and difficult to implement. Therefore, in order to facilitate and encourage reporting by Non-DOC Staff, the Monitoring Team recommends the removal of "results in apparent injury" from the reporting requirement. The recommended modification to § V. (Use of Force Reporting & Tracking), ¶ 10, that we respectfully request your Honor approve and order, is demonstrated in the track changes below.

The City shall require that Non-DOC Staff Members who witness a Use of Force Incident that results in an apparent injury to report the incident in writing directly to the area Tour Commander or to a supervisor who is responsible for providing the report to the individual responsible for investigating the incident. The City shall clearly communicate in writing this reporting requirement to all Non-DOC Staff, and shall advise all Non-DOC Staff that the failure to report Use of Force Incidents that result in apparent injuries, or the failure to provide complete and

Case 1:11-cv-05845-LTS-JCF Document 314 Filed 05/14/18 Page 2 of 4 Case 1:11-cv-05845-LTS-JCF Document 313 Filed 05/11/18 Page 2 of 4

accurate information regarding such Use of Force Incidents, may result in discipline.

This is the seventh request to modify certain provisions of the Consent Judgment.<sup>1</sup> We have discussed the proposed modification with the Parties and they consent to the Monitor's recommendation.

Please do not hesitate to reach out if you have any questions or require any further information.

Sincerely,

s/ Steve J. Martin

Steve J. Martin, Monitor

Anna E. Friedberg, Deputy Monitor

SO ORDERED:

HON/LAURA TAYLOR SWAIN
LINETED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

The foregoing modification is approved.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Appendix A, which provides a summary of the Court ordered modifications to the Consent Judgment.

## Chart of Modifications to Nunez Consent Judgment (Dkt. No. 249)

Docket Entry	Date	Description of Modification Order							
261	11/23/15	Effective Date set							
266	01/05/16	Modification of certain deadlines.							
		Consent Judgment Provision	Description of Provision	Original Deadline	Revised Deadline				
		Section V¶21	Use of Force Reporting and Tracking Department to develop definitions for categories of institutional violence data	60 Days from Effective Date	Additional 30 Days				
		Section XIII ¶ 1	TrainingDepartment to develop new staff training programs (Use of Force policy, Crisis Intervention, Probe Team)	60 Days from Effective Date	Additional 60 days				
		Section XIII ¶ 2	TrainingDepartment to improve staff training (Defensive Tactics, Cell Extraction Team, and Investigator)	60 Days from Effective Date	Additional 60 days				
		Section XIII ¶ 4	TrainingDepartment to develop new Direct Supervision staff training	60 Days from Effective Date	Additional 60 days				
		Section XVI¶3	Inmate DisciplineDepartment to develop and implement an incentive system for inmates under 18	60 Days from Effective Date	Additional 30 Days				
		Section XVI ¶ 4	Inmate DisciplineDepartment to develop and implement a disciplinary system for inmates under 18	60 Days from Effective Date	Additional 30 Days				
268	03/04/16	Additional month for the Second and Third Monitoring Period.							
297		Modification of certain deadlines.							
	4/4/17	Consent Judgment Provision	Description of Provision	Original Deadline	Revised Deadline				
		Section XIII (Training), ¶ 1(c)	Probe Team Training – Deployment of Probe Team Training to all Staff Members assigned to work regularly at any Intake Post.	Within 12 months of the Effective Date	December 31, 2017				
		Section XIII (Training), ¶ 2(b)	Cell Extraction Team Training – Deployment of the Cell Extraction Team Training to all Staff Members regularly assigned to Special Units with cell housing.	Within 12 months of the Effective Date	December 31, 2017				

Docket Entry	Date	Description of Modification Order						
	i	Section XIII (Training), ¶ 4(b)	Direct Supervision Training — Deployment of the Direct Supervision Training to all Staff Members assigned to work regular in Young Inmate Housing Areas.  Case Management System — to be developed and implemented.		Within 9 months of Effective Date	April 30, 2018		
		Section V (Use of Force Reporting & Tracking), ¶ 18 Section X (Risk Management), ¶ 16			December 2016	Develop: August 31, 2017 Implement: December 31, 2017		
		Modification to the calculation of timing of Compliance and Monitor's Report - §XIX. (Reporting Requirements and Parties' Right of Access), ¶¶ 1, 17  AND						
303	8/11/17	Consent Judgment Provision	Description of Provision	Current Deadline Ro		Revised Deadline		
		Section IX (Video Surveillance), ¶ 2(a)	Body Worn Camera Pilot – Pilot of 100 body-worn cameras.	Within one (1) year of the Effective Date		October 10, 2017		
		Consent Judgment Provision	Description of Provision	Original Deadline		Revised Deadline		
312	04/24/18	Section XIII (Training),  1(b)(ii)	Crisis Intervention and Conflict Resolution Training	Within 26 months of the Effective May Date.		May 31, 2019		